

CLEVELAND PUBLIC LIBRARY
Joint Finance, Capital & Community Services Committee Meeting
February 19, 2019
Trustees Room Louis Stokes Wing
12:00 Noon

Present: Ms. Butts, Mr. Seifullah, Ms. Rodriguez, Mr. Hairston, Ms. Washington,
 Mr. Parker, Mr. Corrigan (arrived, 12:09 p.m.)

Absent: None

Mr. Seifullah called the Joint Finance, Capital & Community Services Committee Meeting to order at 12:07 p.m.

Oath of Office

Mr. Parker administered to the Oath of Office to Ms. Washington who was appointed to serve a second term as Vice President of the Cleveland Public Library Board of Trustees at the 2019 Organizational Meeting in January.

Finance Committee (Mr. Seifullah, Chair)

Present: Alan Seifullah, Thomas D. Corrigan, Vice Chair, Anthony T. Parker,
 John M. Hairston, Jr

Absent: None

Resolution to Advance Cash from the General Fund to the MyCom Fund

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that this resolution authorizes that the General Fund advance cash in the amount of \$75,000 to the MyCom Special Revenue Fund for the grants that the Board accepted at last month's meeting.

Ms. Washington stated that there have been some staffing changes at the Cleveland Foundation and asked if those changes affected MyCom funding.

Director Thomas stated that to his understanding MyCom is still being funded by the Cleveland Foundation. It is anticipated that this funding will continue unless future decisions determine otherwise.

Mr. Hairston stated that, in his opinion, when MyCom was moved from the County to the Cleveland Foundation, the scope of MyCom became limited.

Director Thomas stated that he will be attending the Knight Foundation Forum in Miami, FL and Dale Anglin, Program Director, Youth & Social Services, Cleveland Foundation, will also be in attendance. Director Thomas will try to get an update on MyCom from Ms. Agnlin and report back to the Board.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Second Amendment to the Year 2019 Appropriation

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that the Certificate of Estimated Resources has been updated to reflect a net decrease in Other Sources-General Fund by \$40,000 to reflect the resolution going before the Board on February 21, 2019 to advance cash from the General fund to the MyCom fund (\$75,000) and an increase of \$35,000 relating to the second payment from Cleveland Foundation for the hotspot lending grant; and an increase in Other Sources-Special Revenue by \$240,171.24 relating to the \$75,000 cash advance to the MyCom fund; the Founders fund for the \$4,500 PPG Industries pass through grant for the Rockport Branch and \$8,000 Aperture Foundation pass through grant for the Prison Nation exhibit; the MyCom fund for the grant funds of \$74,993.24 for Kindergarten Club and after school tutoring; and the CLEVNET fund of \$77,678 to reflect the reimbursement to be received from Mentor Public Library for the migration fees to join CLEVNET.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Approve the Use of Lockwood Thompson Endowment Funds for International Travel

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that this resolution will allow the Library to use the Lockwood Thompson Endowment Funds in the amount of \$3,297 for Lan Gao, senior subject department librarian of the Youth Services department, to attend the International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (“IFLA”) World Library and Information Congress Annual Conference to be held in Athens, Greece, August 22 through August 30, 2019 and \$4,360 for Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operations Officer, to attend the Next Library 2019 Conference to be held in Arhaus, Denmark, May 30 through June 7, 2019.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Enter Into Agreements and/or Establish Funding Requests for Telecommunication Services for the E-Rate Funding Year 2019: 07/01/2019 through 06/30/2020

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that we have already posted our FCC Form 470 for E-Rate and this is for the Library’s telecommunication services only for Ethernet service. This will allow us to file our FCC Form 471 and enter into an agreement. It has been posted and we are waiting on bids for our Ethernet services which is for all of our branches.

In response to Mr. Corrigan's inquiry, Ms. Krenicky explained that OPLIN provides the head end and the branches go into it. OPLIN pays for that portion and we pay for the branches. The Library is funded 90% through E-Rate funding.

Mr. Hairston asked if E-Rate has become less complicated over the years.

Ms. Krenicky stated that for the Library, since they have eliminated the voice services, this is the only applicable service that we can apply for. We no longer apply for the measured business lines or the cellular funding as the service ended last year.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Amendment to Preliminary Agreement with JKURTZ Architects LTD for the Martin Luther King, Jr. Branch of The Cleveland Public Library

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that this is an extension of the Library's design reset with SO-IL + JKURTZ to provide design services for the design and construction of the new Martin Luther King, Jr. Branch. This resolution gives us another month to work through some design changes.

We have received a full design proposal from SO-IL + JKURTZ. This will also allow us time to review that document and review pricing proposal. This amendment does not require additional costs from the Library.

Ms. Washington asked if the public had the opportunity to provide input to reconsider the design.

Mr. Swetel stated that we have had a number of staff engagement sessions. The next component will be to get public feedback on some of the design changes that were made.

Ms. Washington asked for a clarification on the timeline.

Mr. Swetel stated that he is hopeful to get public feedback within the next month.

In response to Ms. Butts' inquiry, Director Thomas explained that although a new branch manager has not yet been selected for the Martin Luther King, Jr. branch, Harriette Parks, Director of Branch Libraries, has moved her office and is now working out of the branch.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Amending Master Planning Agreement with Bialosky and Partners Architects, LLC

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that this resolution is to amend the agreement with Bialosky and Partners, Architects, LLC. The Library has requested that Bialosky prepare additional architectural rendering services and concept design, perform a real estate assessment,

and conduct a historic façade inspection required by the City of Cleveland of the Main Library and Louis Stokes Wing.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Amending Agreement with June Garcia, LLC for Consulting Services

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that this resolution is to amend the agreement with June Garcia, LLC. The Library has asked June Garcia, LLC to perform more hours of work than initially anticipated, and therefore, desires to amend its agreement with June Garcia, LLC to continue to provide consulting services as the Library continues to move forward with the master planning process and development of a new service model.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Agreement with C.T. Consultants, Inc. for Improvement of Eastman Reading Garden

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that this resolution is for design services for a refresh of the Eastman Reading Garden. As a part of our celebration of the Library’s 150th Anniversary, we would like to restore the Garden back to its condition when it reopened in 1998, include planting plants, lighting and installing electrical outlets for the convenience of patrons and visitors who may need outlets for their electronic devices.

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that this resolution will also authorize the Library to use the Beard Endowment Fund to fund this.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Announcing Construction Manager at Risk for the Martin Luther King, Jr. Branch Determined to Be Best Value and Authorizing Agreement

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that last week the evaluation committee interviewed all five short-listed firms for the Construction Manager at Risk for the Martin Luther King, Jr. Branch.

As a part of that process for the Construction Manager at Risk is the pricing component to help determine the best value for the Library. Based upon the ratings obtained from combining qualifications and pricing scores, the evaluation committee has ranked the short-listed firms in the following order:

- | | |
|------------|-----------------|
| 1) Panzica | \$ 902,516.00 |
| 2) Turner | \$ 1,147,572.00 |

3) Donley	\$ 1,324,724.00
4) Regency	\$ 1,422,853.00
5) Ozanne	\$ 1,943,516.00

Mr. Swetel stated that Ozanne, a Minority Business Enterprise, submitted a proposal. Regency, a combined Female Business Enterprise that teamed with a Minority Business Enterprise, also submitted a proposal. Mr. Swetel noted that both Regency and Ozanne were the highest submissions in the pricing component.

Joyce Dodrill, Chief Legal Officer, stated that because the Library does not own the property, we cannot be considered the owner of this project. In the Development Agreement, we have set up a structure where the Developer would be the Library's agent for construction purposes so we will have a construction agreement with them. They will be the primary name on the contract with the Construction Manager but we will also be on the construction contract and we will direct the Developer through our construction agency agreement as to what they can do with regard to the construction. This is a legal relationship that we had to create because we do not own the property.

In response to Mr. Seifullah's inquiry, Ms. Dodrill stated that when the project has been completed, the title will transfer to the Library. Once we have accepted the construction project, we exchange titles, essentially.

Mr. Corrigan stated that he noticed that from first to fifth the range has doubled and asked for an explanation.

Mr. Swetel stated that one of the items Ozanne proposed was to add a design assist partner which added a level of pricing complexity to his proposal to the Library. The other firms did not have a design assist partner. Lonnie Coleman, Owner of Coleman Sphan, who often does large CMR projects by themselves was Ozanne's design assist partner and those are included in the man hours submitted in their proposal.

Mr. Corrigan asked if there were a concern that our agent would not be able to hold Panzica to the fire.

Ms. Dodrill stated that the Library will essentially be able to control everything through our construction agency agreement.

Mr. Corrigan asked if this number still keeps us in the ballpark of what we thought this project will cost.

Ms. Dodrill stated that the budget now is \$12-15 million and the numbers are within what we thought the project would cost.

Mr. Hairston shared his concern about MBE's and the Library's role to support and help build capacity for minority contractors. MBE's are struggling to get contracts in the City of Cleveland

as contractors such as Panzica are more likely to be in a position to submit lower pricing bid proposals than MBE's.

Mr. Hairston stated that we as a Board should be focused on how we are going to meet our goals regarding diversity and noted that he will not be pleased when Panzica submits its first Change Order to the Board for this project.

Mr. Hairston stated that as the Library moves towards strengthening diversity goals, we should look at the circumstances regarding capacity building.

Mr. Hairston recommended that the Library research the diversity goals for the City of Cleveland according to the Community Benefits Agreement signed by Mayor Jackson, Greater Cleveland Partnership and others, to find out what the Library is required to do to be in compliance.

In response to Ms. Washington's inquiry, Ms. Dodrill stated that there were no members of the Board who sat on the Evaluation Committee.

Ms. Washington asked if in Panzica's response, there was any mention of the desire to partner or subcontract with MBE's on this project.

Mr. Swetel confirmed that as a part of the process, there was a scoring component as a part of the qualification sheet that had a point range for their diversity inclusion plan as a part of the project.

Mr. Swetel explained that although the Library has not set standard goals for diversity, we would enforce that on the Construction Manager at Risk to help us establish those benchmarks. Typically, they go off of what the City of Cleveland does. One of the requirements is a 7% Cleveland based employee requirement for contractors. Percentages go up from there.

Mr. Swetel stated that all of the firms showed us charts on where they landed on each of the projects in terms of diversity and inclusion and all of them met or exceeded the requirements by the City of Cleveland as set forth in the Fannie Lewis Law. Panzica was present when that legislation was signed.

Mr. Swetel stated that Panzica is very committed to diversity inclusion and we can set a very high standard as the Library to ensure that we are meeting those goals if not exceeding them.

Ms. Washington stated that she would like to see an actual plan for the Library's diversity and equity inclusion within the next 60-90 days that spells out our approach to address this and moving forward through all of our projects.

Ms. Washington stated that this was such an important piece and we have not been able to articulate a strong approach or the early development of a plan around that.

Director Thomas stated that we have had conversations around this and noted that the Capital Committee was created to help the Library develop this plan. The Library has over \$100 million worth of work ahead and we need to get in front of it. We need the Board to lead and direct us in this effort. These things will come to the Capital Committee before they come to the full Board.

Mr. Hairston acknowledged the significance of the Capital Committee and saluted Mr. Parker for his leadership as Committee Chair.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Agreement with Cleveland State University for America Reads Tutoring Services

Director Thomas stated that the Library has contracted with Cleveland State University to provide student tutors for America Reads tutoring services at various branches every year since 2012. Typically, we had this supported by the Cleveland Foundation with a grant around \$200,000. They would take on our tutoring and a variety of other services within that \$200,000. The Cleveland Foundation is now focusing those funds on early childhood literacy, and the Library will support the America Reads Tutoring Services and fund it from the Founders Fund.

In response to Mr. Seifullah's inquiry, Director Thomas stated that the tutors are usually students for Cleveland State University's Education Department who are aspiring to be teachers.

Various Board members expressed their satisfaction with the service provided by the America Reads tutors.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Publication of Request for Qualifications for Design Services for Master Plan Projects

Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operating Officer, stated that Bialosky is nearing completion of the facilities master plan, and the Library anticipates spending approximately \$60 million remodeling or constructing branches during the first phase of implementing the master plan. The Library will present the phase one projects to this Board for approval. This resolution authorizes the Library to publicize Requests for Qualifications for Design Services for Master Plan Projects in excess of \$50,000. This will give the Library the ability to request qualifications from those firms who would like to submit proposals for our projects. When the Capital Committee vets on what branches will be selected for phase one, we will have a substantial list of design firms from which to select, interview and negotiate with those who seem best fitted for those projects.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Corrigan seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Capital Committee (Mr. Parker, Chair)

Present: Anthony T. Parker, Thomas D. Corrigan, Vice Chair, Maritza Rodriguez,
Alice G. Butts

Absent: None

Presentation: Facilities Master Plan (Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operations Officer)

Director Thomas stated that he asked Jeremiah Swetel, Chief Operations Officer, to give the Board an overview on all of the work that he and Bialosky have done on the Master Plan to this point. Director Thomas emphasized that direction from the Board is needed to move forward.

Mr. Parker motioned that Ms. Washington serve as a member of the Capital Committee. Ms. Butts seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Mr. Swetel stated that as the Capital Committee reviews system recommendations that the Board will have the opportunity to dream about the possibilities for our buildings that will raise the expectations of residents in each neighborhood. Our buildings have a unique way of communicating our mission, vision and values. Fitting our buildings in our strategic priority is essential.

Mr. Corrigan stated that the information from our facilities plan was melded with our Strategic Plan.

Mr. Swetel reviewed the purposes for a Facilities Master Plan:

- *Assess Current State of our Facilities*- Conduct an assessment of all the Cleveland Public Library's 27 branches and Main Campus to identify necessary maintenance needs and determine the physical potential to renovate, expand or build new for each as needed to continue providing a high level of service to the community.
- *Identify Community Needs* - Collect input from Cleveland's communities about their libraries to determine what they are doing well and what they can do to better serve their patrons.
- *Create a Plan for the Future* - Analyze the findings and create a plan for how to maintain, renovate or replace buildings over the next 10 years to support Cleveland Public Library's strategic priorities.

Mr. Swetel stated that there 27 unique branches serving diverse communities. During the Master Planning process the following key components were considered: Community Open House Feedback; Building and Site Evaluations; Community Demographics and Usage Data; and Assessments of Maintenance Costs. After doing comparisons, the findings resulted in a Master Plan recommendation.

Service areas were also reviewed that include: (1) Attendance, Circulation and Service Area Population; (2) Occupied Area Analysis. This information is useful in determining opportunities such as expansion.

Deferred Maintenance Assessments were completed on each branch and Main campus that included façade, interior, current shelving layouts, light fixtures, mechanical equipment, etc. Reports will be compiled for each facility that will include a photo, brief history, date it was constructed, square footage, and a list of what was found wrong with the facility.

Mr. Swetel gave an overview of the Engagement Summary which included but was not limited to: Open Houses, Public Meetings, Display Boards and Surveys. Additional outreach consisted of:

- Met individually with each Branch Manager to discuss community needs
- Presented at Ward 10 meeting (10.16.18) for Collinwood Branch
- Presented at Ward 7 meeting (10.23.18) for Addison Branch
- Met with Bellaire-Puritas (CDC) for Rockport Branch
- Met with Famicos Foundation (CDC) for Langston Hughes Branch & Glenville Branch
- Met with Burton Bell Carr (CDC) for Garden Valley Branch
- Met with MetroWest (CDC) for Fulton Branch
- Installed Summary Display Boards at each branch for those unable to attend Public Meetings
- Attended Fulton Branch Reopening Celebration to gather feedback/invite attendees to 11.27 Public Meeting

To determine if our buildings meet the Library's needs and fit the Library's vision for the future, the following criteria was established:

- Is the site: Available, Accessible, Flexible, Community Focused
- Is the building: Adaptable, Equitable, Collaborative, Maintainable, Visible

Evaluation cards for each facility included the site and building criteria which had the following indicators: Adequate, Inadequate, Limited. Mr. Swetel showed examples of Hough and Lorain.

Mr. Hairston acknowledged Timothy Diamond, Chief Knowledge Officer, for his hard work on the Community Vision Plan and his work with Kent State University's Cleveland Urban Design Collaborative.

In response to Mr. Hairston's inquiry, Mr. Swetel confirmed that all of the CUDC findings have been reviewed prior to the evaluations.

Mr. Swetel stated that branches were categorized by size:

- Small –Neighborhood Branch (size: 5,000 - 10,000 sf; ie: Brooklyn, Eastman, Glenville). This space can be considered as Community Living Room; a place to meet daily needs.
- Medium – Community Hub (size: 12,000 - 15,000 sf; ie: Mt Pleasant, Collinwood, Rice). This space can be considered as a Resource Center; a broader scope of services that still has a community focus.
- Large – Regional Anchor (size: 20,000 - 30,000 sf; ie: MLK, Carnegie West). This space can be considered a Destination; a unique experience and location for large scale civic events.

Mr. Swetel gave an overview of Systems Evaluations:

Maintaining an Accessible Network - Cleveland Public Library maintains a broad reach in the city's urban neighborhoods with a dense network of smaller branches. This provides access to a critical service for the large population of patrons who rely on walking or public transportation to get to their local branch.

Extending Service Efficiently - A resident of communities served by the Cleveland Public Library should not have to travel more than 2 miles from their Neighborhood Branch to access a Community Hub. These Hub branches are located on transit lines to facilitate easier access from the greater community.

Mr. Corrigan noted that the area that never seems to be covered is by Burke Lakefront Airport and Cleveland Hopkins Airport and stated that we may need to find creative ways to service those areas.

Creating an Iconic Presence - identifying select branches as Regional Anchors affords the library the opportunity to create locations that provide experience and resources that go beyond the typical library. These locations house special collections in iconic buildings that can serve as venues for larger scale civic events.

Upholding Institutional Identity - Cleveland Public Library is an institution that serves all of Cleveland and beyond. Its vast collection and reputation as a renowned research institution make it a resource for the entire region.

Mr. Swetel stated that branch size may need to be reconsidered and noted the following as possible recommendations to enhance and accommodate service for a 21st century library and provided detailed descriptions of each:

- Renovate & Expand (ie, Jefferson, Carnegie West)
- New Building (ie, Hough, Rockport)
- Main Campus (ie, Renovate & Reorganize)

Mr. Swetel gave an overview and description of the following Renovation/Construction Budget Levels:

- Existing Condition/Deferred Maintenance
- New Building/New Construction

Mr. Swetel gave an overview and description of the following Renovation Levels:

- Interior Refresh
- Full Interior Renovation
- Major Renovation

Discussion continued about the possible renovation of Main Library.

Tena Wilson, Deputy Director, stated that no decisions have been made and will not be made without prior discussion and input from staff.

Director Thomas stated that voters were informed that funds received from the levy would specifically go to the neighborhood branches. No levy funds will be used towards Main Library.

Ms. Washington ask for clarification on the decision making process that recommends new construction vs refresh.

Director Thomas explained that community input contributes in decision making process and gave the example of communities that surround the Mt. Pleasant and East 131st branches. Those two communities had discussions about closing both branches and building one new branch that is centrally located between the two neighborhoods.

Director Thomas stated that some neighborhoods expressed that they liked the branches that they have but would prefer updates.

Mr. Swetel's presentation continued with a review of draft Project Budget options and Project Schedule options that include timeframes to spend down funds collected from the sale of bonds.

Director Thomas stated that we can consider conservative, moderate and aggressive ranges for funds that the Library can raise. The maximum amount of funds that the Library could raise would be approximately \$140 million which would put the Library at a high debt limit. This could put the Library at possible risk as we would have to pay back at least \$8 million each year. Phase I building projects at a cost of \$60 million would allow us to have a payback of about \$3.7 million. If the economy should decline, the Library would still be able to cover this debt obligation.

Director Thomas stated that for the first step the Capital Committee would take would be to discuss the finances: the bonds and indebtedness. Secondly, as the process is designed, we will move forward with construction. We must consider the political piece as well as the companies that we will be using. The community should feel as if they have opportunities to work with the Library on these projects.

Ms. Rodriguez stated that we must be aware that the figures in the draft budgets that were discussed today are subject to increase.

Mr. Swetel stated that the figures used are based on today's dollars. However, on the spread sheet attached to the Facilities Master Plan, those figures will be based on escalation over the entire 10 year time frame. As we submit to Stifel and the bond counsel, they will want to see what we are projecting as inflation and escalation over the 10 years and our capacity to spend all of that money down.

Ms. Rodriguez stated that contractors are at premium now and they are charging more and asked if a slow-down is anticipated and the price may slightly decrease.

Ms. Swetel stated that his numbers are inclusive of everything including design fees, Construction Manager at Risk, FF&E packages, AV and technology for the branch and that overall prices could slightly decrease.

Finally, Mr. Swetel showed pictures of possibilities for Woodland Branch as a distribution facility, as well as reimaged interiors and exterior spaces for Lorain, Hough, Rockport branches.

Director Thomas stated that after receiving community input, designs have been prepared for each branch. We will be asking the Board for direction on financing, who will be doing the work, prioritizing branches and politically how we time the work. The Capital Committee will bring recommendations to the full Board for approval.

Director Thomas thanked Mr. Swetel for his detailed presentation.

Community Services Committee (Mr. Corrigan, Chair)

Present: Thomas D. Corrigan, Anthony T. Parker, Vice Chair, Alice G. Butts,
Alan Seifullah

Absent: None

Amendment to Fines and Fees Schedule

Timothy Diamond, Chief Knowledge Officer, explained that while the language of the resolution provides an ethical and philosophical argument for going fine free, there are additional factors for the Board to consider. First is the effect that overdue fines have on the library accounts of our patrons. Currently, over 3,300 adults and nearly 800 juveniles are blocked because of overdue fines; not lost items--just overdue fines on items that have been returned. The adults owe an average of \$40 and the juveniles owe an average of \$35. With other bills to pay, this is a bill that can go unpaid by a low-income patron without any repercussions, but the cost is the loss of library privileges. The second factor is that overdue fines are no longer a significant source of revenue. Last year, the Library collected \$56,000 in overdue fines compared to \$196,000 in 2009. This is largely due to automatic renewals instituted in 2018 across CLEVNET coupled with the continuing drop in video circulation that once generated a significant amount of overdue fine revenue with shorter loan periods and higher overdue fines. The Library also has to figure what it costs in staff time to collect and process fines across the entire system—certainly more than \$56,000 in the course of the year.

The third factor is that we recognize that going “fine free” is a trend that is gaining momentum--in CLEVNET, in Ohio and across the nation. Other libraries that are members of Urban Libraries Council that have gone fine free include District of Columbia, Enoch Pratt (Baltimore), Saint Paul, Miami-Dade, San Diego, Salt Lake City, Denver, Albuquerque, and Nashville. In Ohio, the metropolitan libraries that are fine free are Columbus, Dayton, Toledo and Stark County. In CLEVNET, Cleveland Heights-University Heights went fine free last year. At first, it did not seem that any other CLEVNET libraries would follow; however, eight other member library systems across five counties have or are in queue to go fine free this year. The directors of these

libraries will be sharing their best practices and experiences at the next quarterly CLEVNET meeting in April.

The fourth factor is that CPL has a history of fine elimination going back to 1977 when we eliminated fines for seniors. In 1978, we stopped fines for children's materials. In 1992, we eliminated fines for the disabled; in 2001: young adult materials and homebound patrons. So while other large systems such as Philadelphia and Multnomah County are only now beginning to experiment with fine elimination by making children's materials fine free, CPL was a pioneer in the movement four decades ago.

Mr. Diamond shared comments made during the internal debate librarians had at CPL in the 1970s about children's materials that still ring true today:

“Many families whose needs seem greatest forbid their children to use libraries because they fear fines. We do not believe any moral lessons involved in the paying of fines outweigh the gains made in learning to use books.” -- Marian Huttner, Special Assistant to the Director, 1978

“. . . charging fines has not made the children more careful, responsible and sensitive. It simply has kept them away from the library and the books.” -- Community Services Work Group, 1977

In closing, Mr. Diamond explained that while overdue fines would be eliminated, patrons would still be charged for the replacement cost of the book or other materials if not returned. Currently, CPL materials are considered lost if not returned 28 days after they are due. The Leadership Team may consider shortening that time period as other libraries have done that have gone fine free.

Mr. Corrigan motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Ms. Butts seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Director Thomas announced that CJ Lynce, TechCentral Manager, has accepted the position as Deputy Director of the Westlake Porter Public Library. March 22, 2019 will be Mr. Lynce' last day with Cleveland Public Library.

Mr. Seifullah adjourned the Joint Finance, Capital & Community Services Committee Meeting at 1:29 p.m.